



**MEETING MINUTES**

**Restoration Advisory Board (RAB)**

**For the Former Naval Station Roosevelt Roads**

**Centro Cívico la Seyba, Ceiba, Puerto Rico**

**Meeting No. 6 - October 25, 2007**

*Note: These minutes are a summary based on informal notes taken at the meeting. They are not intended as a verbatim transcript and may not have captured everything that was discussed. If comments or additional notes are provided by others who were present at the meeting, within 30 days of distribution of these minutes, those will be added as an attachment to these minutes.*

**I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOMING REMARKS**

---

- The meeting began at 6:05 PM with introduction provided by Susana Struve/CH2M HILL. See Attachment 1 - Attendees List.

**II. ACTION ITEMS**

---

The following action items were discussed and their status updated.

<b>Item</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	<b>Status as of October 25, 2007</b>
<b>#1</b>	Navy: Provide a list of upcoming documents for the RAB members to identify where they would like technical assistance.	List was mailed to RAB members and available at this meeting.	Completed
<b>#2</b>	Navy: Provide information about SWMU 46 and AOC C, where RAB member Ismael Velázquez believes that transformers contaminated the soil with PCBs.	Details about the investigation of this site were presented at the August RAB meeting - Pole Yard Site. The Navy will prepare a work plan to investigate the site.	Completed

<b>Item</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	<b>Status as of October 25, 2007</b>
<b>#3</b>	Navy and RAB Community Members: Develop and sign the Roosevelt Roads RAB charter.	RAB members to meet internally to discuss the proposed changes, respond to the Navy, or finalize if they are in agreement.	Ongoing
<b>#4</b>	Navy: Provide more information about suspicions that a cache of ammunition had been covered over (vegetated mound observed in the magazine area, during the RAB March 2007 site tour - "the mound").	The Navy is investigating further what activities may have taken place at these former buildings.	Ongoing
<b>#5</b>	Lilyana Betancourt: Share with Navy her list of buildings/facilities she believes are affected by contaminants.		Awaiting list from Lilyana
<b>#6</b>	Navy: Provide technical presentations for each of the sites under investigation (found on the deliverables list).	SWMU 9, SWMU 27, SWMU 28, SWMU 29, and SWMU 68 presentations provided at this meeting	Ongoing
<b>#7</b>	Ismael Velázquez: Provide information about a spill he witnessed at Pole Yard.	Pedro Ruiz accompanied Ismael to locate this area; EPA previously designated this release as SWMU 78.	Completed
<b>#8</b>	Puerto Rico Conservation Trust to provide information about recreational activities that will be compatible with the conditions of the mangroves.	Presentation given at the meeting by Dr. Jorge Baez (Fideicomiso).	Completed
<b>#9</b>	LRA to request PR Department of Natural Resources (DNR) participation in RAB meetings.	DNER representative was requested by LRA (Freddy de Jesús); however, PRDNR did not attend this meeting.	Ongoing
<b>#10</b>	Navy (Jeff) to email the English version of Responsiveness Summary for CDR to RAB members (Lirio Márquez and Jorge Porto).	The Responsiveness Summary has been mailed.	Completed
<b>#11</b>	LRA to take RAB member (Rafael Montes) to the dry area across the bay, identify the place and respond to his concerns.		Ongoing
<b>#12</b>	BRAC PMO office will check on the security measures that are taken on Piñeros Island. Mark will also verify what the signage says on the		New

Item	Description	Discussion	Status as of October 25, 2007
	Island.		
#13	Ramón Figueroa: Next meeting he will clarify the controversy of the dry forest location/ designated use concern.		New
#14	Tito Colorado (LRA) to come to the meeting to inform RAB of what benefit the hospital will be to the public here in this area.		New
#15	Tito Colorado will contact the Secretary of the PRDNR again to get commitment from PRDNR to send a representative to the next meeting.		On going

### III. RAB MEMBERS' TOPICS NOT ADDRESSED AT LAST MEETING (AUGUST 2007)

- (Mark Kimes/Baker Environmental, Inc.):

Provided information regarding utilities and residual contamination; mothballing of fuel tanks and piping on the base; and fuel pipelines and hydrant pits (renamed SWMU 74). See presentation for more details.

- (Mark Davidson/Navy): Piñeros Island Update:

First phase of investigation was a magnetometer survey to identify anomalies. Second phase (currently being conducted) is investigation of the anomalies. The first step is to prepare an Explosive Safety Submission (ESS) for submission to the Naval Ordnance Safety and Security Activity (NOSSA), which is the regulatory body governing the munitions and explosives field work.

The ESS will be submitted in late October. Once approved, the Work Plan will be performed in the field (early January/February 2008).

- Ismael Velázquez (RAB member): Stated that the island is no longer patrolled by the Navy, but there are people going there. If there are any explosives, who is responsible for the safety of people on the island? There is no signage on the island warning of explosives, they just say "Private Property – Do Not Enter."

Mark D. replied that the Navy is responsible for the security of the public, and there is signage warning of the dangers on the island (a slide from the August 2007 meeting was projected showing a picture of a sign on the island warning of UXO dangers).

- (Wilmarie Rivera/PREQB): Presented slides informing the public of the role of EQB in the cleanup process.
  - Luis Velázquez (RAB member): Have you really seen the sales plans, their location involves part of the mangroves and the contaminated area? Who from the EQB has been overseeing the surveys to really see this agency taking measurements and analyzing the areas that are planning to be sold? Some areas should not be sold, they should be conserved.
 

Wilmarie: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) have that jurisdiction (mangroves). Some inspections were made in 2005, she and Yarissa were there. But EQB doesn't have that jurisdiction. The Puerto Rico Department of Natural Resources (PRDNR) does, but they are not present tonight due to a scheduling conflict.
  - Freddy de Jesús (local reuse authority [LRA]) added that he had confirmation that one of the PRDNR representatives would come, but he is not present. No one knows why. Wilmarie says there was a symposium today that may have conflicted with this meeting.
  - Luis Velázquez (RAB member): Then nobody can answer the questions. For the next meeting, we need an answer for this. For example, Punta Puerca should be conserved, but instead is planned to be sold. It's really a dry forest and not suitable for development. Ceiba has many areas that should be conserved because they are natural resources.
  - Ramon Figueroa (RAB Co-Chair): It is negligent and shows lack of respect that the PRDNR representative did not show up to this meeting; he will address this issue with Tito Colorado of the LRA.
  - Lirio Márquez (RAB member): One of the comments she submitted during the public comment period on the Covenant Deferral Request (CDR) was the issue that there would be some changes in the land use plan proposed by the LRA (including conservation of the dry forest). Have they submitted this request to the Navy?
  - Jorge Fernandez Porto (RAB member): Believes that the LRA has the authority to go directly to the Navy about this land use, and represent the concern of the community to the Navy.
  - Lilyana Betancourt (Community member): Showed map of the base and stated that the Navy has failed to ask EPA to conduct a serious and detailed inventory of the places that have been contaminated and are still contaminated. She has prepared a list that she wants details on from Mark D. Mark reminded her that the Navy is still waiting to receive a copy of her list.

#### IV. WHAT'S NEW

- Jeff Meyers (Navy BRAC Environmental Coordinator) provided an update on recent transfer activities (hospital/conservation, clinic, Department of Homeland Security [DHS], and mangroves restoration). See presentation for more details.
  - Jorge Fernandez Porto: The property title will be transferred to this corporation [Servicios de Salud Episcopales, Inc.]. Will the title deed, not only the operation, be transferred to a private entity?
  - Freddy de Jesus (LRA) answered that it is a not-for-profit organization. Ramón said the answer is “yes.” To his understanding, this institution (Episcopales) acts as Public Benefit Conveyance (PBC). He doesn’t know exactly who they are. Yes, the title deed will also be transferred to them.
  - Rafael Montes (RAB member): Understands that for the sites that are transferred to nonprofit organizations, if they disappear, they are returned to the hands of the government.
  - Ismael Velázquez: Heard that in the agreement with BRAC on this base, there will be an emergency room in the hospital that will cover the area (Ceiba, Culebra, and Vieques). They did it so that BRAC would give them that opportunity.

#### V. Puerto Rico Conservation Trust Presentation

- Dr. Jorge Baez, Director of Protected Areas and Scientific Investigation, presented information regarding PRCT’s (Trust’s) role in the cleanup/transfer process. Explained that the PRCT is a nongovernmental organization, not part of the government. It is an institution that works with the community and educates the community. There are several programs that are implemented for this purpose. The PRCT management philosophy is conservation through citizen participation. “Citizen Scientists” are every day people who can participate in a scientific investigation, taking information and doing the research. They don’t know specifically which areas the Trust can protect for the people of Puerto Rico, they want citizens to participate.
  - Lirio Márquez: Asked question regarding recreational use of the wetlands (i.e., the recently rehabilitated channel, and this area for use by the fishermen). Dr. Baez replied that they have not developed a specific zoning plan for this use, but will do this with the community’s involvement.
  - Lirio: When will this happen? As soon as we are transferred the management of the area? It hasn’t happened yet.
  - Jorge Porto: It has been more than two years since we’ve been told that this area will be transferred to the Trust, and they are clearly marked out. We’ve been told that the lands are suitable for transfer. What is the Trust proposal for the management of these wetlands? We have no idea how we will be asked to participate. So you’re saying the Trust still doesn’t know how they will manage the wetlands?

- Dr. Baez: No. What I'm trying to clarify what we do and our management philosophy. The truth is that where we have mangroves in other areas, what we do is protect them. It is complicated because the management has to be done with the consent of different agencies. An agreement has to be reached about what can be done in different areas. We will go into this process immediately and form a plan as quickly as possible. People will have participation in this.
- Ismael Velazquez: We are confused. For example, take the case of Las Cabezas de San Juan. It's been turned into a business. We have to pay to go in. The same thing will happen here at Roosevelt Roads.
- Dr. Baez: No. That's why I want to present what the Trust does. It's not a business, it is conservation. The idea is that in order to protect in some situations you have to employ low-impact use for the area (i.e., minimal charge for entry to Las Cabezas de San Juan). We don't charge in all cases. I don't want this to be the image that is presented here. There are many other lands open to the public and support educational philosophy.
- Jeff Meyers: Some of the conservation lands do have low-impact use language in the deed. But they are legally restricted from putting active businesses in there.
- Jorge Porto: It was pointed out that here no one has been given the opportunity to participate in the planning of the management of the wetlands. It was negotiated in an unknown meeting that the Trust would be managing the area. There was no community present. After a long time we are still waiting for the management proposal. We still don't have anything. No date as to when the property will be transferred, etc. We are asking to participate.
- Ramón Figueroa: I suggest that you speak with the superiors at the Trust and tell him that four years ago the base at Roosevelt Roads was closed. Whether we like it or not, the Trust is responsible for this land. We don't want any surprises. We would like for the agency to establish a plan to manage this adequately. This requires identifying some funds as part of the plan. We want to all have our feet on the ground and assume responsibility for this plan.
- Lilyana Betancourt: Who constitutes the Trust? I am concerned that if you are the keepers of the coastal areas, and if you work with federal grants and funds.
- Dr. Baez: We are not only here as messengers. We represent the Trust so your concerns are a commitment.
- Lirio Márquez: The Trust receives funds from the rum excise taxes from the Puerto Rican government. I want to encourage the Trust to converse as soon as possible with the community. Areas of the wetlands are historically used by the fisherman (before the Navy was there). At present they are low-impact recreational uses, and those uses should not be excluded.

- Dr. Baez: I want to be clear that we can't assume the entire responsibility for the conservation of this area, but we are with you, and we will design the management plan with you, the community.

## VI. Overview of Selected Sites

- Mark Kimes gave a summary of five sites (SWMU 9, SWMU 27, SWMU 28, SWMU 29, and SWMU 68). The documents associated with these five sites will be made available for public review in the future after regulatory concurrence. See presentation for more details.
  - Lirio Marquez: Where will we be able to see these documents? Mark: The documents will be posted on the website after the documents are final and have been reviewed and approved by the EPA.
  - Lirio: Has the Ecological Risk Assessment (ERA) been done yet for SWMU 9? Mark: When we found the new spot of contamination we didn't know about, we stopped the ERA so that we could incorporate whatever contaminant was there into the ERA and evaluate the new contaminants within the ERA.
  - Lirio: Is the Corrective Measures Investigations (CMI) report available for public comment? Mark: The Statement of Basis which comes out of the CM report is available for comment. The CMI recommends the remedial action. If the EPA approves, then the Statement of Basis is created and goes out for public comment.
  - Ramón Figueroa: Tito Colorado has repeatedly announced that the LRA is negotiating with the Navy in terms of recommending (or not recommending) the signature of the Governor (of the Covenant Deferral Request [CDR]). What impact does the Navy have on the relationship between the LRA and the Governor? You guys are supposed to know in detail what is going on in terms of the cleanup process. I was wondering if the people who are talking to the Governor (on behalf of the Navy) are getting this feedback from you. It is a matter of money. I'm talking specifically about the Early Transfer Parcels.
  - Jeff Meyers: It has been proposed that the LRA incorporate the cleanup into their parcels (ports and airfield). There is a negotiation as to how much the Navy will pay the LRA to do the cleanup. Matrix has supplied a proposal for this.
  - Jorge: By now the Early Transfer Process (CDR) should be signed. How long will the Navy wait to see if it is assigned to begin cleaning? What if it's never signed? Will they leave it contaminated? What is the deadline of waiting for the CDR to be signed before they just go ahead and clean? Is there any other element from preventing the Gov from signing than money? You know we don't agree with the Early Transfer Process so I'm not trying to hurry the process.

- Jeff: There is a date when the Navy assumes the government will not sign the CDR. In the meantime, the process of cleaning up is ongoing, it is continuing. Another concern for the Governor is whether the process will continue with the new owner.
- Jorge: Is there any other major obstacle than how much the Navy is willing to pay the Governor?
- Lirio: The bidding is supposed to take place in Jan/Feb. When are the prospective buyers supposed to put down the “deposit”? Is that the cutoff date for the whole process? Jeff: They have to initially put down a bid, and then pay the rest of the amount when the bidding closes. This information is available on the website. The schedule for the auction is affected by the CDR signing by the Governor.
- William Lourido (RAB member): Are these properties always returned back to the government, or can they be directly turned back to the airport? Jeff: The government applied for the PBC, and the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) approved it (for the airport).
- Ramón: The problem is that there is a phase that has already happened, when the LRA planned the proposed use and who would manage it. Unfortunately that happened without any of us noticing it. From the beginning of the process, there were opportunities for the different communities to request the different resources from BRAC (PBC, etc.). But the information was not provided to the public and now it is not possible. The process was not done correctly.
- William: Can this decision be challenged by the community in the courts? Can we get together and try to bid for the airport for the community?

## VII. Planning the Next Meeting

- Susana: The next meeting is proposed for January 16.
  - (Community member): The meeting was supposed to take place before the early transfer of Parcel 2.
  - Jeff: That parcel will probably not be transferred in January. The planned date is at the end of January. Once they place bids there is a 30-day evaluation period to make sure of their financial standing.
  - Susana: Then the decision is January 16 at 6 PM in the same location. Susana asked that Ramón work with the other members of the RAB to discuss the agenda for the next meeting.

## VIII. Miscellaneous

- Jorge Porto: Didn't receive the notice of this meeting.
  - Susana: We are still having problems with the mailing. Please give us a call if you don't hear anything about the meeting time and place in two months.

- Luis (Community member): Read a document developed by Jorge and Lirio. This document needs to be part of the historical records that is being done for the CDR.
  - Jeff: the English part of that document is part of the federal record. They are public comments on the CDR.

MEETING ADJOURNED.

## ATTACHMENT 1 - Meeting Attendees

<b>RAB Community Members in Attendance</b>	<b>RAB Community Members Absent</b>
<b>Ramón Figueroa, Community Co-Chair</b>	Carlos Brown
Jorge Fernández Porto	Samuel Caraballo
Lirio Márquez D'Acunti	Jimmy Concepción Robles
William Lourido	Ángel de Jesús Matta
Debra McWhirter	José Díaz
Rafael Montes	Rogelio Figueroa
Agustin Velázquez Santos	Daniel González
Ismael Velázquez	John Henry
Luis Velázquez Rivera	Myrna Maldonado
	Ramón Rios
	Noraida Vázquez Arce
<b>Community Members Visiting</b>	
Carliana Lausguleo (sp?)/PRSBTDC	Danny Velázquez
Samuel Santiago	Naida Davila
Roberto Morales	Marc J. Tallmadge
Pedro Torres	Marilyn del Manzano
Francisco Rosano	Sonia Rodriguez
Nelly Lopez	Lilyana Betancourt
A. Garcia	Raquel _____ (illegible)
Diane Dalton	Luisa _____ (illegible)
Michael Dalton	José A. Rosa/APRODEC
Roberto Hernandez	
<b>RAB Agency Representatives in Attendance</b>	
<b>Mark Davidson, Navy Co-Chair</b>	Remedial Project Manager for the former Naval Station Roosevelt Roads
Josefina A. González	EQB
Wilmarie Rivera	EQB
Luis Negrón	USEPA
Dr. Jorge Baez	PRCT (w/Santiago Oliver, PRCT)
Freddy de Jesús	LRA (Portal del Futuro) (w/Linda Balcom, Weston Solutions)

---

**Other Agency Representatives Present**

---

Pedro Ruiz	Environmental Program Manager, Naval Activity Puerto Rico (NAPR)
Jeff Meyers	BRAC Environmental Coordinator, Navy Program Management Office Southeast

---

**Support Staff Present**

---

Susana Struve	CH2M HILL, Inc. (meeting facilitator, Navy contractor)
Mark Kimes	Baker Environmental, Inc. (Navy Installation Restoration Program, Contractor)
Sara Vivas	CH2M HILL, Inc. (meeting notes, Navy contractor)

**ATTACHMENT 2 - Meeting Presentations**

## **ATTACHMENT 3 - Meeting Handouts**